

Naturalis Repository

Time-calibrated phylogenies reveal mediterranean and pre-mediterranean origin of the thermophilous vegetation of the Canary Islands

Sara Martín-Hernanz1, Manuel Nogales, Luis Valente, Mario Fernández-Mazuecos, Fernando Pomeda-Gutiérrez, Emilio Cano, Patricia Marrero, Jens M. Olesen, Ruben Heleno and Pablo Vargas

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1093/aob/mcac160>

Downloaded from [Naturalis Repository](https://repository.naturalis.nl)

Article 25fa Dutch Copyright Act (DCA) - End User Rights

This publication is distributed under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act (Auteurswet) with consent from the author. Dutch law entitles the maker of a short scientific work funded either wholly or partially by Dutch public funds to make that work publicly available following a reasonable period after the work was first published, provided that reference is made to the source of the first publication of the work.

This publication is distributed under the Naturalis Biodiversity Center 'Taverne implementation' programme. In this programme, research output of Naturalis researchers and collection managers that complies with the legal requirements of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act is distributed online and free of barriers in the Naturalis institutional repository. Research output is distributed six months after its first online publication in the original published version and with proper attribution to the source of the original publication.

You are permitted to download and use the publication for personal purposes. All rights remain with the author(s) and copyrights owner(s) of this work. Any use of the publication other than authorized under this license or copyright law is prohibited.

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the department of Collection Information know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, Collection Information will make the material inaccessible. Please contact us through email: collectie.informatie@naturalis.nl. We will contact you as soon as possible.

Time-calibrated phylogenies reveal mediterranean and pre-mediterranean origin of the thermophilous vegetation of the Canary Islands

Sara Martín-Hernanz[1](#page-1-0),[2](#page-1-1),[*](#page-1-2) , Manuel Nogale[s3,](#page-1-3) , Luis Valent[e4](#page-1-4)[,5,](#page-1-5) , Mario Fernández-Mazuecos[6](#page-1-6),[7](#page-1-7) , Fernando Pomeda-Gutiérre[z1](#page-1-0) , Emilio Can[o1](#page-1-0) , Patricia Marrer[o1](#page-1-0)[,3](#page-1-3) , Jens M. Olese[n8](#page-1-8) , Ruben Helen[o9](#page-1-9) and Pablo Vargas[1](#page-1-0)

¹ Department of Biodiversity and Conservation, Real Jardín Botánico de Madrid (RJB-CSIC), 28014 Madrid, Spain, ²
2 Department of Plant Biology and Ecology, Eaculty of Pharmacy, Universidad de Sevilla, 41012 Sevilla, Sp *Departament of Plant Biology and Ecology, Faculty of Pharmacy, Universidad de Sevilla, 41012 Sevilla, Spain, 3 Island Ecology and Evolution Research Group, Instituto de Productos Naturales y Agrobiología (IPNA-CSIC), 38206 San Cristóbal de La Laguna, Tenerife, Canary Islands, Spain, 4 Naturalis Biodiversity Center, 2333 Leiden, The Netherlands, 5 Groningen Institute for Evolutionary Life Sciences, University of Groningen, 9700 AB Groningen, The Netherlands, 6 Department of Biology (Botany), Faculty of Sciences, Universidad Autónoma de Madrid, 28049 Madrid, Spain, 7 Centro de Investigación en Biodiversidad y Cambio Global (CIBC-UAM), Universidad Autónoma de Madrid, 28049 Madrid, Spain, 8 Department of Biology, Aarhus University, 8000 Aarhus C, Denmark and 9 Centre for Functional Ecology, TERRA Associate Laboratory, Department of Life Sciences, University of Coimbra, 3000-456 Coimbra, Portugal * For correspondence. E-mail [sara.martin.hernanz@gmail.com](mailto:sara.martin.hernanz@gmail.com?subject=)*

Received: 29 August 2022 Returned for revision: 21 November 2022 Editorial decision: 19 December 2022 Accepted: 21 December 2022 Electronically published: 3 January 2023

• Background and Aims The Canary Islands have strong foristic affnities with the Mediterranean Basin. One of the most characteristic and diverse vegetation belts of the archipelago is the thermophilous woodland (between 200 and 900 m.a.s.l.). This thermophilous plant community consists of many non-endemic species shared with the Mediterranean Floristic Region together with Canarian endemic species. Consequently, phytogeographic studies have historically proposed the hypothesis of an origin of the Canarian thermophilous species following the establishment of the summer-dry mediterranean climate in the Mediterranean Basin around 2.8 million years ago. **• Methods** Time-calibrated phylogenies for 39 plant groups including Canarian thermophilous species were primarily analysed to infer colonization times. In particular, we used 26 previously published phylogenies together with 13 new timecalibrated phylogenies (including newly generated plastid and nuclear DNA sequence data) to assess whether the time interval between stem and crown ages of Canarian thermophilous lineages postdates 2.8 Ma. For lineages postdating this time threshold, we additionally conducted ancestral area reconstructions to infer the potential source area for colonization. **• Key Results** A total of 43 Canarian thermophilous lineages were identifed from 39 plant groups. Both mediterranean (16) and pre-mediterranean (9) plant lineages were found. However, we failed to determine the temporal origin for 18 lineages because a stem–crown time interval overlaps with the 2.8-Ma threshold. The spatial origin

of thermophilous lineages was also heterogeneous, including ancestral areas from the Mediterranean Basin (nine) and other regions (six). **• Conclusions** Our fndings reveal an unexpectedly heterogeneous origin of the Canarian thermophilous species

in terms of colonization times and mainland source areas. A substantial proportion of the lineages arrived in the Canaries before the summer-dry climate was established in the Mediterranean Basin. The complex temporal and geographic origin of Canarian thermophilous species challenges the view of the Canary Islands (and Madeira) as a subregion within the Mediterranean Floristic Region.

Key words: Thermophilous woodland, Canary Islands, Mediterranean Floristic Region, colonization times, stem age, crown age, ancestral area, extinction.

INTRODUCTION

Oceanic islands emerge lifeless from the seafoor and are usually separated from continents by wide stretches of sea, which means that all of their terrestrial plants have their origin in other landmasses. The Canary archipelago is formed by seven volcanic islands situated ~100 km off the Saharan coast (north-western Africa). Since their emergence (last 21 million years), plant lineages have colonized the islands from the mainland, grouping together into six main vegetation belts: coastal

vegetation, xerophytic shrubland, thermophilous woodland, laurel forest (laurisilva), pine woodland, and alpine legume scrub ([del Arco and Rodríguez-Delgado, 2018](#page-16-0)). Interestingly, the origin of these foral elements is not well understood. Despite the proximity of the islands to the current Saharo-Arabian Floristic Region ([Takhtajan, 1986\)](#page-17-0), only some elements of the coastal vegetation and xerophytic shrubland of the Canarian fora are linked to this region ([Rivas-Martínez, 2009](#page-17-1)). Iconic tree species of the laurel forest have been traditionally considered both subtropical in origin and surviving representatives of a once more widely distributed Tertiary–Tethyan fora [\(Bramwell, 1976;](#page-16-1) [Mai, 1995\)](#page-16-2); a more heterogeneous origin has been lately suggested by [Kondraskov](#page-16-3) *et al.* (2015). Irrespective of some foristic elements connecting the Canary Islands with foristic regions of the Sahara–Arabia, East/South Africa and America ([Quézel, 1978](#page-17-2); [Grehan, 2016\)](#page-16-4), most phytogeographers agree that the Canarian fora has a predominant connection with the Mediterranean Floristic Region (MFR).

Since the 18th century, phytogeographers have been discussing whether plants of the Canaries and other Macaronesian archipelagos of the Atlantic Ocean form an independent foristic region or a subregion within the MFR ([del Arco and](#page-16-0) [Rodríguez-Delgado, 2018\)](#page-16-0). On the one hand, high species endemicity (-35%) and numerous floristic elements linked to several continental foras are considered strong arguments to accept a high-level phytogeographic classifcation (Macaronesian Floristic Region; [Engler, 1879](#page-16-5); [Sunding, 1979;](#page-17-3) [Takhtajan, 1986;](#page-17-0) [Bolòs, 1996](#page-16-6)). On the other hand, a high percentage of Mediterranean elements and lineages are in turn understood as a clear criterion to propose a lower-level phytogeographic classifcation (Canarian–Madeiran subregion of the MFR; [Meusel, 1965;](#page-17-4) [Lobin, 1982](#page-16-7); [Rivas-Martínez, 2009](#page-17-1); [del](#page-16-0) [Arco and Rodríguez-Delgado, 2018](#page-16-0)). The Mediterranean element is pervasive in the six vegetation belts of the Canaries in such a way that plant lineages exhibiting traits common in mediterranean climates or having their centres of diversity in the Mediterranean Basin are particularly abundant in the pine woodland and thermophilous woodland ([Francisco-Ortega](#page-16-8) *et al.*[, 2002](#page-16-8); [Rivas-Martínez, 2009;](#page-17-1) [White](#page-18-0) *et al.*, 2020; [Albaladejo](#page-15-0) *et al.*[, 2021\)](#page-15-0). Indeed, the thermophilous vegetation is the plant community most associated with the MFR, including some arboreal and shrubby communities named in Spanish after their dominant tree species: 'sabinares' (*Juniperus turbinata* subsp. *canariensis*), 'almacigares' (*Pistacia atlantica*), 'lentiscales' (*Pistacia lentiscus*) and 'acebuchales' (*Olea europaea* subsp. *guanchica*) [\(Fernández-Palacios](#page-16-9) *et al.*, 2008; [Nezadal and](#page-17-5) [Welss, 2009\)](#page-17-5). The last three tree species have sclerophyllous leaves with fexural stiffness and strength ([Schimper, 1903;](#page-17-6) [Read and Sanson, 2003\)](#page-17-7), which characterize the vegetation of the MFR ([Rundel](#page-17-8) *et al.*, 2016; [Vargas, 2020](#page-17-9)). All these sources of evidence suggest that the phytogeographic origin of Canarian plant lineages may be predominantly associated with the MFR. If so, the question remains as to whether phylogenetic relationships and divergence times of a signifcant number of species from the thermophilous woodland can provide evidence of a temporal mediterranean origin, i.e. following the establishment of the mediterranean climate across the Mediterranean Basin [\(Carine](#page-16-10) *et al.*, 2004; [Fernández-Palacios](#page-16-9) *et al.*, 2008; [Vargas,](#page-17-9) [2020\)](#page-17-9).

The establishment of the mediterranean climate across southern Europe and northern Africa 2.8 million years ago (Ma) provides the opportunity to consider a relatively welldefned temporal framework. This temporal threshold (2.8 Ma) is based on independent evidence from palaeoceanographic [\(Hernández-Molina](#page-16-11) *et al.*, 2014), palaeoclimatic ([Hernández-](#page-16-11)[Molina](#page-16-11) *et al.*, 2014; Grant *et al.*[, 2022\)](#page-16-12), palaeobotanical [\(Bocquet](#page-15-1) *et al.*, 1978; [Suc, 1984;](#page-17-10) [Palmarev, 1989](#page-17-11); [Tzedakis,](#page-17-12) [2007;](#page-17-12) [Postigo](#page-17-13) *et al.*, 2009; [Jiménez- Moreno](#page-16-13) *et al.*, 2010) and phylogenetic ([Fiz-Palacios and Valcárcel, 2013](#page-16-14) and references

within it) information that supports a 'sharp' climatic event. In particular, the establishment of the mediterranean climate brought about a signifcant environmental change because of the concurrence of a drought period during the warm season. Interestingly, this threshold is close to the boundary between the Pliocene and Pleistocene (2.6 Ma), as recognized by the International Chronostratigraphic Chart ([https://stratigraphy.](https://stratigraphy.org/chart) [org/chart](https://stratigraphy.org/chart)). Such a temporal threshold has been used in multiple studies to categorize Mediterranean foristic elements according to their temporal origin (paleo-mediterranean versus neo-mediterranean; [Herrera, 1992;](#page-16-15) [Peñuelas](#page-17-14) *et al.*, 2001; [Verdú](#page-18-1) *et al.*[, 2003](#page-18-1)). In addition, it has been used to test specifc hypotheses such as the timing of colonization of the Canary Islands by certain lineages [\(Vargas, 2007;](#page-17-15) Salvo *et al.*[, 2010](#page-17-16)), diversifcation rate shifts ([Fiz-Palacios and Valcárcel, 2013\)](#page-16-14) and karyotypic changes ([Escudero](#page-16-16) *et al.*, 2018) in combination with time-calibrated phylogenies.

The use of phylogenetic analyses based on DNA sequences to estimate the timing of evolutionary events has become a basic tool in biogeography [\(Sanmartín, 2014](#page-17-17)). Time can be measured in absolute units when the tree is calibrated with fossils, phylogeny-based secondary calibrations and/or biogeographic events ([Forest, 2009](#page-16-17); [Ho and Phillips, 2009](#page-16-18); see [Hipsley and](#page-16-19) [Müller, 2014](#page-16-19) for alternative calibration approaches). In particular, relaxed-clock Bayesian methods can elucidate a posterior distribution on the age of a node, taking into account the uncertainty associated with tree topology, branch length and calibrations ([Drummond](#page-16-20) *et al.*, 2006; [Yang and Rannala, 2006](#page-18-2)). This method can be applied to a large number of plant groups, thus helping describe general patterns (e.g. [Pokorny](#page-17-18) *et al.*, 2015; [Vargas](#page-18-3) *et al.*, 2018). The time-calibrated phylogenies obtained from Bayesian relaxed-clock methods are also used as input for inferring the ancestral areas from which colonization may have occurred (e.g. [Albaladejo](#page-15-0) *et al.*, 2021). These ancestral area reconstruction analyses give new possibilities for quantitative analysis in island biogeography ([Lamm and Redelings,](#page-16-21) [2009\)](#page-16-21). Thus, applying time-calibrated phylogenetic approaches to investigate the divergence of Canarian lineages from their continental relatives may provide valuable insight into the very complex patterns of relationships between the Canary Islands and continental foras ([Carine](#page-16-10) *et al.*, 2004; [Kondraskov](#page-16-3) *et al.*, [2015;](#page-16-3) [Caujapé-Castells](#page-16-22) *et al.*, 2017; [Valente](#page-17-19) *et al.*, 2017).

Palaeoclimatic, foristic and phytogeographic studies led us to examine the hypothesis of an origin of Canarian thermophilous species following the establishment of the mediterranean climate across the Mediterranean Basin 2.8 Ma. To test this hypothesis, we frstly analysed the phylogenetic relationships of thermophilous Canarian lineages and their sister groups using improved phylogenetic datasets in terms of extended taxonomic and geographic sampling. Secondly, we evaluated whether ancestral thermophilous plant lineages had a temporal origin since the mediterranean climate became established around 2.8 Ma (Suc *et al.*[, 2018\)](#page-17-20), based on both newly generated and previously published time-calibrated phylogenies. Thirdly, we implemented ancestral area reconstruction analyses to assess whether colonization of thermophilous Canarian lineages had a potential source area for colonization in the Mediterranean Basin or another geographic area. In sum, we are quantifying the degree to which there is a spatio-temporal biogeographic link between the Canarian fora and the MFR.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Study area

The thermophilous woodland is a vegetation type characteristic of the Canary Islands. It occurs between the xerophytic vegetation and the laurel forest on the windward slopes (~200– 500 m.a.s.l.) and between the xerophytic vegetation and the pine woodland on the leeward slopes (~300–900 m.a.s.l.) [\(del](#page-16-23) Arco *et al.*[, 2006](#page-16-23); [Fernández-Palacios](#page-16-9) *et al.*, 2008). It has a mediterranean-type climate with annual rainfall between 250 and 450 mm, mostly occurring in winter, and with average temperature between 15 and 19 °C, depending on elevation. The thermophilous woodland is defned by some communities dominated by tree species also found in southern Europe and northern Africa (particularly *Juniperus turbinata*, *Pistacia atlantica*, *Pistacia lentiscus*, *Olea europaea*), which may be accompanied by endemic trees (*Gymnosporia cassinoides*, *Dracaena draco*, *Phoenix canariensis*, *Sideroxylon canariense*, *Visnea mocanera*). In addition, a high number of shrub and herb species characterize this vegetation belt ([Fernández-Palacios](#page-16-9) *et al.*[, 2008](#page-16-9)). Unfortunately, this vegetation type is extremely rare in a pristine state because its trees have been eliminated by anthropogenic activity. Chronologically, African human groups colonized the seven islands, who mostly settled around 2000 years ago, and a more severe deforestation has taken place since colonization by European groups [\(Fernández-Palacios](#page-16-9) *et al.*[, 2008](#page-16-9)). As a result, currently only 11 % of the original thermophilous woodland is estimated to remain ([Fernández-](#page-16-9)[Palacios](#page-16-9) *et al.*, 2008; [Castilla-Beltrán](#page-16-24) *et al.*, 2021).

Sampling strategy and DNA sequencing

In this study, stem and crown ages were inferred by extending DNA sequence datasets of 13 previously published phylogenies, which included a total of 16 thermophilous species (7 Canarian endemics, 5 Macaronesian endemics, 4 non-endemic natives) occurring in the Canary Islands. These previous datasets are heterogeneous and the published phylogenies share some of the following weak points: (1) low support for monophyletic groups including Canarian species; (2) poor sampling of potential mainland sister groups (species/populations); (3) poor sampling of species or populations from the Canary Islands; (4) lack of divergence time estimates; and (5) need for technical improvement in terms of new methods or calibration points ([Table](#page-4-0) [1](#page-4-0)). Additionally, stem and crown ages for 26 plant groups with species occurring in the Canarian thermophilous vegetation belt were taken directly from the literature ([Supplementary Data](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data) [Table S1\)](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data). A total of 39 thermophilous plant groups (i.e. genera, rarely family) were analysed.

To generate new data on divergence times for 16 thermophilous species, we frst obtained 13 DNA sequence datasets from the most comprehensive phylogenetic studies at the genus level (occasionally at family level). Alignments were provided directly by authors of the studies or obtained from the GenBank or TreeBase databases. GenBank accession numbers and geographic origin for all downloaded sequences are available in each publication referenced in [Table 1](#page-4-0). Second, we extended taxonomic and/or population sampling of these DNA sequence datasets to infer stem and crown nodes for the Canarian species or populations. The new samples were obtained from three sources: feld trips, herbarium specimens, and colleagues who contributed with feld samples ([Supplementary Data Table S2](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data)). We tried to sample at least one individual per island where the taxon is present depending on available material and accessibility of populations. We additionally sampled at least one individual from the most closely related species based on taxonomic information when not available in the DNA sequence database. For non-endemic taxa, we also sampled individuals from at least two populations from nearby continental areas. Many plants of the Canary Islands have a Palaearctic origin ([Sunding, 1979;](#page-17-3) [Carine](#page-16-10) *et al.*, 2004), and thus we focused our sampling on the archipelagos and mainland regions of Africa and Europe that are close to the Canary Islands, with particular effort being made for Mediterranean Iberia and north-western Africa [\(Valente](#page-17-19) *et al.*, 2017). Overall, we newly generated 262 DNA sequences from 104 samples of 33 taxa (16 representative thermophilous species and 17 close relatives) and 16 different DNA regions, which were included in the published DNA sequence datasets. Sample information for all specimens and GenBank accession numbers for all new DNA sequences are provided in [Supplementary Data Table S2.](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data)

DNA was extracted from dried leaves using the Qiagen DNeasy Plant Mini Kit according to the manufacturer's protocol. Sixteen different DNA regions were amplifed and sequenced based on previously published studies for each plant group ([Supplementary Data Table S2\)](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data). In particular, we analysed two nuclear regions (ETS and ITS), one mitochondrial region (PHYC) and 13 plastid DNA regions (*mat*K, *psb*A-*trn*H, *psb*B1-*psb*B2, *rbc*L, *rpl*16, *rpl*32-*trn*L, *rps*4, *trn*D-*trn*T, *trn*K, *trn*L-*trn*F, *trn*L-*trn*F, *trn*S-*trn*G, *trn*V). Primers and PCR cycles applied for each plant group are included in [Supplementary](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data) [Data Table S3](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data). Amplifed products were sequenced by standard Sanger sequencing at Macrogen Europe (www.macrogen.com). We used Geneious 2021.2.2 [\(https://www.geneious.com\)](https://www.geneious.com) to edit chromatograms, aligned sequences with the MUSCLE algorithm [\(Edgar, 2004](#page-16-25)) and concatenated DNA regions [\(Table](#page-4-0) [1\)](#page-4-0). The resulting alignments were checked visually and corrected where the algorithm failed to identify gaps.

Phylogenetic relationships

We applied Bayesian inference analysis to the 13 DNA sequence datasets to infer the phylogenetic relationships of plant groups with thermophilous species in the Canary Islands. The best-ftting substitution model for each partition (DNA region) was selected using the Akaike information criterion implemented in jModelTest v.0.1.1 [\(Posada, 2008](#page-17-21)). We did not test the congruence between nuclear and plastid matrices because this was already analysed in the previous phylogenetic studies. Thus, we used the phylogenetic dataset (single or combined DNA matrix) that provided the highest phylogenetic resolution in those studies [\(Table 1](#page-4-0), [Supplementary Data Figs](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data) [S1–S13\)](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data). MrBayes v.3.2.6 [\(Ronquist](#page-17-22) *et al.*, 2012) was used in all cases on XSEDE via the CIPRES Science Gateway [\(http://](http://www.phylo.org/) www.phylo.org/) with two simultaneous runs, each with four parallel Markov chains (three hot and one cold), and sampled every 10 000 trees to obtain a total of 10 million generations. The frst 25 % of trees of each run were discarded (burn-in) and 50 % majority-rule consensus trees were constructed. An Table 1. *List of the 16 Canarian thermophilous plant species for which colonization times were newly inferred for this study. Taxonomic* rank, DNA regions and bibliographic references of the DNA sequence datasets used are indicated, as well as the calibrated approach and *the bibliographic reference on which the strategy for calculating divergence times is based on. The last column indicates the reasons why the original datasets had to be improved, namely: (1) low support for monophyletic groups formed by Canarian species; (2) poor sampling of potential mainland sister groups (species/populations); (3) poor sampling of species or populations from the Canary Islands; (4) lack of divergence time estimates; and (5) need for technical improvement in terms of new methods or new calibration points. DNA regions marked in bold indicate the regions for which we have provided new sequences in this study (more details on the samples included by genus and species in [Supplementary Data Table S2\)](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data)*

*Macaronesian endemics; **Canarian endemics. Species with no asterisks are non-endemic natives.

additional approach using maximum likelihood was implemented in RAxML to obtain an alternative estimate of phylogenetic relationships and support values ([Supplementary Data](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data) [Methods S1](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data)).

Divergence times

To estimate divergence times of stem and crown nodes for plant groups with thermophilous species in the Canary Islands,

we generated 13 new time-calibrated phylogenies using the Bayesian uncorrelated log-normal relaxed clock model in BEAST 1.84 ([Drummond and Rambaut, 2007](#page-16-26)). We used the same substitution models already applied for the phylogenetic reconstructions. For each analysis, we ran two independent chains of 100 million generations with a birth–death tree prior, which accounts for both speciation and extinction ([Gernhard,](#page-16-27) [2008\)](#page-16-27). All molecular dating analyses in BEAST were performed using the computer cluster Trueno (CSIC, Madrid, Spain). We assessed convergence of chains and appropriate burn-ins with Tracer v.1.7.1 [\(Rambaut](#page-17-32) *et al.*, 2018), combined runs using LogCombiner, and produced maximum clade credibility (MCC) trees with mean node heights in Tree Annotator.

Calibration points used to estimate divergence times were based on the fossil record and published secondary calibration points, depending on data availability for each plant group [\(Supplementary Data Figs S14–S26](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data)). When reliable fossils were available, a lognormal prior on age estimates was used, since this distribution better represents the stratigraphic uncertainty associated with the fossil record ([Ho and Phillips, 2009\)](#page-16-18). The offset of the lognormal distribution was set to the upper bound of the stratigraphic period where the fossil was found. In the absence of reliable fossils, only secondary calibration points taken from original papers were implemented to the corresponding deep nodes [\(Table 1\)](#page-4-0). Secondary calibration points were obtained from fossil-calibrated phylogenies of higher taxonomic ranks, which included samples of our study groups (e.g. typically the family to which the genus belongs), and were assigned normal distribution priors ([Ho and Phillips, 2009](#page-16-18)) in the BEAST analysis including the mean and the 95 % highest posterior density (HPD) interval from those studies. A summary of time constraints used for each DNA dataset and their provenance can be found in [Supplementary Data Figs S14–S26.](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data)

Colonization times: crown and stem ages

Colonizations of the Canary Islands by a lineage have taken place at a time between the stem age and the crown age of the lineage ([Fig. 1](#page-6-0); [Swenson](#page-17-33) *et al.*, 2014; [García-Verdugo](#page-16-34) *et al.*, [2019a](#page-16-34)). The stem age, representing the time of divergence between the island lineage and the mainland sister lineage, is more commonly used as an indicator of colonization time [\(Fig. 1A;](#page-6-0) see examples in [Keeley and Funk, 2011](#page-16-35); [Spalik](#page-17-34) *et al.*, [2014](#page-17-34); [Kondraskov](#page-16-3) *et al.*, 2015; [Grover](#page-16-36) *et al.*, 2017; [Schüßler](#page-17-35) *et al.*[, 2019](#page-17-35)). However, the stem age tends to overestimate colonization time as a result of extinction or incomplete sampling of closely related mainland lineages ([Fig. 1B;](#page-6-0) [Mairal](#page-16-37) *et al.*, [2015](#page-16-37); [Pillon and Buerki, 2017](#page-17-36)). Alternatively, recent studies have used the crown age, which corresponds to the onset of the divergence from the most recent common ancestor of the lineage within the archipelago, and thus a minimum time for the colonization from the mainland ([Fig. 1A](#page-6-0); [Pokorny](#page-17-18) *et al.*, 2015; [García-Verdugo](#page-16-34) *et al.*, 2019a). However, the crown age may provide an underestimate of colonization time, due to extinction of island lineages or poor sampling of the archipelago ([Fig.](#page-6-0) [1C;](#page-6-0) see examples of Canarian lineages potentially affected by extinction in [Sanmartín](#page-17-37) *et al.*, 2008; and [García-Verdugo](#page-16-38) *et al.*, [2019b](#page-16-38)). Therefore, the crown age represents the minimum age (lower bound) at which colonization of the archipelago from the mainland could have occurred, whereas the stem age represents the maximum age (upper bound) of that event.

To address our working hypothesis, we compared both stem and crown ages with the 2.8-Ma threshold, which marks the establishment of the mediterranean climate $(Suc, 1984)$ $(Suc, 1984)$. By considering the stem node as the upper limit and the crown node as the lower limit of colonization time, our approach accounts for the potential impact of lineage extinction and incomplete sampling on colonization time estimates. Based on estimates of stem and crown ages (mean and 95 % HPD intervals) from 26 previously published and 13 newly generated phylogenies, we classifed 43 Canarian thermophilous lineages into three categories: (1) mediterranean lineages, when stem and thus crown ages postdated the 2.8-Ma threshold (i.e. both the stem and the crown node are mediterranean in time); (2) premediterranean lineages, when crown and thus stem ages predated the 2.8-Ma threshold (i.e. both the stem and the crown ages are pre-mediterranean); and (3) undetermined lineages, for those groups with stem ages falling any time before this threshold (pre-mediterranean stem ages) and crown ages afterwards (mediterranean crown ages) ([Fig. 2](#page-7-0)).

In the context of this hypothesis, the term 'mediterranean' refers to a window of colonization of the Canary Islands after the establishment of the mediterranean climate (temporal origin) in the Mediterranean Basin. This does not necessarily imply that the lineages colonized the thermophilous belt directly from the Mediterranean Basin. Indeed, the closest mainland taxa for a few of the Canarian lineages are not from the Mediterranean Basin according to the literature ([Supplementary Data Table](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data) [S1](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data)). Although both temporal and spatial origins would have ideally to be fulflled for a lineage to be considered 'mediterranean', we frst classify taxa according to temporal origin rather than geographic origin to address our working hypothesis because the temporal framework allows us to integrate stem age and crown age estimates together and thus partially circumvent the impact of poor sampling, low phylogenetic resolution, extinction and fuctuant limits of the MFR over time (see Discussion section).

Nodes could not be unambiguously designated as mediterranean or pre-mediterranean when their 95 % HPD intervals spanned the 2.8-Ma threshold [\(Fig. 2](#page-7-0)). For these nodes, a complementary approach was taken [\(Fig. 3](#page-8-0)). Marginal probability distributions of divergence times for such nodes were extracted from 100 000 trees using TreeStat v.1.8.4 ([Rambaut](#page-17-38) [and Drummond, 2016\)](#page-17-38). Then, we used the percentage of occurrence of node ages before or after the 2.8-Ma threshold, following the approach of Vargas *et al.* [\(2014\)](#page-18-5). In other words, a node was considered mediterranean when the majority of the marginal probability distribution of the node age postdated the establishment of the mediterranean climate (2.8 Ma), and as pre-mediterranean when the majority of the marginal probability distribution of the node age predated such a threshold ([Fig. 3\)](#page-8-0). We chose a 50 $%$ threshold to include the majority of probability distributions ([Vargas](#page-18-5) *et al.*, 2014). For the previously published time-calibrated phylogenies we took a different approach, in which the mediterranean or pre-mediterranean status of nodes was estimated based on mean values of node ages given by the authors.

In some cases, low phylogenetic resolution and the tree topology hinder estimation of stem and crown ages. For instance, this can happen when the posterior probability (PP) of nodes is low (<0.90), or when multiple representatives of Canarian lineages are placed at distant positions in the tree with low support. These reconstructions make it difficult to distinguish between incomplete lineage sorting and multiple colonization events. In such cases, a most inclusive approach was taken, in which we considered the time estimate of the most recent common ancestor (TMRCA) of island and mainland lineages to be an upper bound. Since this TMRCA is equivalent to the stem age (when relationships are resolved), it also represents

Estimates of colonization times on oceanic islands: stem vs. crown ages

Fig. 1. Two approaches typically used to infer colonization times on oceanic island: stem (solid circles) and crown (open circles) ages. Brown lines represent lineages with mainland distribution while green lines represent lineages with insular distribution. Dashed lines represent extinct or unsampled lineages. (A) Graphical representation of stem and crown ages of a hypothetical island lineage (modifed from [García-Verdugo](#page-16-34) *et al.*, 2019a). (B) Impact of considering extinction or incomplete taxon sampling of the mainland ancestor on stem age estimates. (C) Impact of considering extinction or incomplete taxon sampling of the archipelago ancestor on crown age estimates.

A

Fig. 2. Classifcation of lineages according to divergence times for the Canarian thermophilous plant community, following the methodology proposed in this paper. (1) Mediterranean lineages when stem and thus crown ages postdate the 2.8-Ma threshold; (2) pre-mediterranean lineages when crown and thus stem ages predate the 2.8-Ma threshold; and (3) undetermined lineages for those groups with stem ages before and crown ages after this temporal threshold. For these cases, 95 $\%$ posterior credibility intervals (blue bars) do not span the 2.8-Ma threshold, and therefore nodes can be unambiguously designated as mediterranean or pre-mediterranean.

the maximum age at which the lineage may have colonized the archipelago [\(Valente](#page-17-19) *et al.*, 2017).

Ancestral area reconstructions

To reconstruct the ancestral distribution range of the lineages with thermophilous species in the Canary Islands (both endemics and non-endemic natives), we employed a model-based maximum likelihood approach for ancestral area optimization: the dispersal–extinction–cladogenesis (DEC) model implemented in the BioGeoBEARS R package [\(Matzke, 2013\)](#page-17-39). For the sake of brevity and addressing our working hypothesis, biogeographic reconstructions were conducted using only three geographic areas (A = Mediterranean Basin, B = Macaronesia, $C =$ other regions), allowing ancestors to be present in a maximum of three areas. We set symmetrical dispersal between areas, and constant dispersal rates through time. The analyses were run using the MCC tree of the 13 newly inferred timecalibrated phylogenies (see Materials and methods, Divergence times) after pruning tips in multi-sampled species in order to represent each species with a single terminal branch. We estimated whether colonization occurred from the Mediterranean Basin (A, AB, AC, ABC) or from other geographic areas (C, BC) by considering the most likely ancestral distribution range recovered for the stem node of the Canarian lineages (or for the TMRCA when the PP of stem nodes was <0.90). As a result, we interpreted that any ancestral range shared by the Mediterranean Basin and the Canary Islands indicates an origin from the Mediterranean Basin.

RESULTS

Newly inferred phylogenetic relationships

Our phylogenetic reconstructions based on Bayesian Inference using MrBayes ([Supplementary Data Figs S1–S13\)](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data) and maximum likelihood using RAxML (results not shown) are in accordance with previously published phylogenies regarding the topological relationships for the thermophilous species occurring in the Canary Islands. However, the phylogenetic support obtained for temporal divergence using BEAST was higher in most cases [\(Supplementary Data Figs S14–S26](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data)). For this reason, we selected the phylogenetic trees obtained in BEAST to describe the phylogenetic relationships and the statistical support values of the nodes.

Most of the thermophilous plants analysed formed well-supported monophyletic species ([Figs 4–6](#page-9-0), Supplementary [Data Table S1](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data)). However, we could not confrm the monophyly of Canarian populations of non-endemic species (i.e. *Ephedra fragilis*, *Juniperus turbinata*, *Pistacia atlantica*, *Pistacia lentiscus*) as well as the endemics *Asparagus umbellatus* and *Thesium retamoides* [\(Figs 4A–E](#page-9-0), [5C](#page-10-0) and [6D](#page-11-0), [Supplementary](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data) [Data Table S1\)](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data). Similarly, sister-group relationships had high statistical support (>0.90 PP), except for the non-endemic species and for the Macaronesian endemic species *Dracunculus canariensis* [\(Figs 4A–E](#page-9-0) and [6F](#page-11-0), [Supplementary Data Table S1](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data)).

The following phylogenetic relationships within the Canarian groups or between the Canarian species and continental sister groups were documented for the frst time: (1) placement of *Asparagus scoparius* within the clade of *Asparagus nesiotes* and *Asparagus plocamoides*, and placement of *Asparagus umbellatus* within the clade of *Asparagus fallax* and *Asparagus arborescens*; (2) close relationship of the two Canarian species of *Gymnosporia* (*G. cassinoides* and *G. cryptopetala*, which are sisters to the Madeira endemic *G. dryandrii*); (3) *Chrysojasminum odoratissimum*, sister to the mainland clade of *Chrysojasminum parkeri*, *Chrysojasminum humile*, *Chrysojasminum bignoniaceum* and *Chrysojasminum*

Fig. 3. Assignment of mediterranean versus pre- mediterranean nodes when the 95 % posterior credibility interval (blue bars) spans the 2.8-Ma threshold: (1) mediterranean nodes, when most of the posterior distribution of trees (>50 %) provide node ages younger than 2.8 Ma; and (2) pre-mediterranean nodes, when most of the trees (>50 %) provide node ages older than 2.8 Ma.

fruticans; and (4) the two Canarian species of *Thesium* (*Thesium retamoides* and *Thesium subsucculentum*) sister to the mainland *Thesium mauritanicum* [\(Figs 4–6\)](#page-9-0).

As a result of our phylogenetic reconstructions, 16 independent Canary Island colonization events were inferred for the 13 plant groups with thermophilous species analysed: ten genera with a single colonization and two with more than one colonization (three of *Pistacia* and two of *Asparagus*) ([Figs](#page-9-0) [4–6](#page-9-0), [Supplementary Data Table S4\)](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data). In addition, some lineages displayed cladogenesis in the Canary Islands, including species from other vegetation zones: *Asparagus* lineage I (*A. umbellatus* in the thermophilous woodland, *A. arborescens* in the xerophytic shrubland and *A. fallax* in the laurel forest), *Asparagus* lineage II (*A. scoparius* in the thermophilous woodland, *A. nesiotes* in xerophytic shrubland and *A. plocamoides* in the pine forest), *Gymnosporia* (*G. cassinoides* and *G. cryptopetala* in the thermophilous woodland) and *Thesium* (*T. retamoides* in thermophilous woodland and *T. subsucculentum* in the xerophytic shrubland) ([Figs 4–6](#page-9-0)). For these cases (i.e. lineages that diversifed in different vegetation zones of the Canary Islands), stem and crown ages considered to categorize lineages as mediterranean or pre-mediterranean were those corresponding to the entire Canarian or Macaronesian lineage (including thermophilous and non-thermophilous species).

Colonization times

The estimated mean crown ages of the 16 Canarian lineages newly analysed in this study ranged from 1.07 Ma within *Heberdenia excels* to 7.99 Ma within *Sideroxylon canariense*, while mean stem ages ranged from 1.15 Ma for *Pistacia atlantica* to 37.73 Ma for *Sideroxylon canariense* [\(Figs 4–6](#page-9-0), [Supplementary Data Figs S14–S26,](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data) [Supplementary Data Table](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data) [S4](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data)). These age ranges include fve cases in which the TMRCA had to be used: *Asparagus lineage* II, *Ephedra fragilis*, *Juniperus turbinata* subsp. *canariensis*, *Pistacia atlantica* and *Pistacia lentiscus* lineage II. Considering the complete list of 43 lineages (including those with previously published timecalibrated phylogenies), we identifed 16 mediterranean lineages, nine pre-mediterranean lineages and 18 undetermined lineages [\(Table 2,](#page-12-0) [Supplementary Data Table S1\)](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data).

Mediterranean lineages (stem ages <2.8 Ma). The newly generated phylogenies allowed identifcation of fve thermophilous plant lineages as mediterranean with respect to their colonization times, as their stem ages postdated the 2.8-Ma threshold: *Asparagus* lineage I, *Asparagus* lineage II, *Ephedra fragilis*, *Pistacia atlantica* and *Pistacia lentiscus* lineage II ([Fig. 4](#page-9-0)). Most stem ages accumulated a marginal posterior distribution clearly after the 2.8-Ma threshold, so they were assigned as mediterranean with high statistical support [\(Supplementary](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data) [Data Table S4\)](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data). The highest uncertainty was estimated for the stem node of *Asparagus* lineage II, in which only 61 % of the stem age distribution fell in the last 2.8 Ma. Additional studies taken from the literature provided 11 more plant lineages as mediterranean. As a result, a total of 16 of the 43 thermophilous lineages display a clear-cut mediterranean origin [from youngest to oldest stem ages (Ma) [\(Fig. 7\)](#page-13-0): *Globularia* lineage

Fig. 4. The fve thermophilous lineages of mediterranean origin (stem and therefore crown ages postdate 2.8 Ma) and related Canarian and mainland species from the 13 time-calibrated phylogenies inferred in this study using BEAST. Mean stem and crown ages and 95 % posterior credibility intervals (blue bars and values in brackets) are indicated. Divergence times of the most recent common ancestor (marked as TMRCA) are also indicated for those groups in which stem and crown nodes showed low phylogenetic support [PP < 0.90, bootstrap (BS) support value <70]. Circles at the nodes represent phylogenetic relationships with high posterior Bayesian probability (PP) and/or BS support values (see Statistical support values legend). Colour of plant names indicates vegetation type. Asterisks represent new samples included in the present study. The letters close to the stem node or TMRCA of the Canarian lineages represent the ancestral ranges inferred for that node by the ancestral area reconstruction analysis and correspond to the following geographic areas: A, Mediterranean Basin; B, Macaronesia; C, other regions (several letters imply ranges that include multiple areas).

(0.30), *Smilax aspera* (0.30), *Cistus monspeliensis* (0.50), *Brachypodium arbuscula* (0.80), *Erysimum* lineage (0.80), *Pistacia atlantica* (1.15, [Fig. 4C](#page-9-0)), *Ephedra fragilis* (1.29, [Fig. 4E\)](#page-9-0), *Convolvulus* lineage II (1.50), *Asparagus* lineage II (1.60, [Fig. 4B\)](#page-9-0), *Solanum* lineage (1.70), *Helianthemum* sect. *Helianthemum* (1.82), *Argyranthemum* lineage (2.20), *Olea europaea* subsp. *guanchica* (2.60), *Malva canariensis* (2.78) and *Asparagus* lineage I (2.80, [Fig. 4A\)](#page-9-0)]. Although the stem age estimates of *Asparagus* lineage I clearly overlaps the mediterranean threshold, >60 % of the stem age distribution and 96 % of crown age distribution fell within the mediterranean climate period.

Pre-mediterranean lineages (crown ages >2.8 Ma). The newly generated phylogenies allowed identifcation of three of the 16 thermophilous plant lineages as pre-mediterranean, as their crown ages predated the 2.8-Ma threshold: *Sideroxylon canariense*, *Chrysojasminum odoratissimum* and *Thesium* lineage [\(Fig. 5](#page-10-0)). Crown ages for *C. odoratissimum* and *S. canariense* accumulated a marginal posterior distribution clearly before 2.8 Ma, so they were assigned as pre-mediterranean with high statistical support ([Supplementary Data Table S4](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data)). The highest uncertainty was estimated for the crown node of the *Thesium* lineage, in which only 69 % of the age distribution predated 2.8 Ma. Previously published studies revealed six additional pre-mediterranean lineages. As a result, nine of the 43 thermophilous lineages displayed a pre-mediterranean origin [from youngest to oldest crown ages (Ma) [\(Fig. 8\)](#page-14-0): *Sideritis* lineage (3.30), *Echium* lineage (3.70), *Thesium* lineage (3.86), *Chrysojasminum odoratissimum* (4.79), *Euphorbia* sect. *Aphyllis* subsect. *Macaronesicae* (6.92), *Sideroxylon canariense* (7.99), *Ruta* lineage (8.10), *Crambe* lineage (8.20) and *Sonchus* lineage (8.50)].

Undetermined lineages (stem ages >2.8 Ma, crown ages <2.8 Ma). The temporal origin of eight of the 16 thermophilous lineages were undetermined because their stem ages predated and their crown ages postdated the 2.8-Ma threshold: *Bosea yervamora*, *Bryonia verrucosa*, *Dracunculus canariensis*, *Gymnosporia* lineage, *Heberdenia excelsa*, *Juniperus turbinata* subsp. *canariensis*, *Pistacia lentiscus* lineage I and *Rhamnus crenulata* ([Fig. 6\)](#page-11-0). Most of their stem and crown ages

Fig. 5. The three pre-mediterranean lineages (i.e. crown and thus stem ages predate 2.8 Ma) and related Canarian and mainland species from the 13 time-calibrated phylogenies inferred in this study using BEAST. Mean stem and crown ages and 95 % posterior credibility intervals (blue bars and values in brackets) are indicated next to the corresponding nodes. The circles at the nodes represent phylogenetic relationships with high posterior Bayesian probability (PP) and/or bootstrap (BS) support values (see Statistical support values legend). Colour of plant names indicates vegetation type. Asterisks represent new samples included in the present study. The letters close to the stem node of the Canarian lineages represent the ancestral ranges inferred for that node by the ancestral area reconstruction analysis and correspond to the following geographic areas: A, Mediterranean Basin; B, Macaronesia; C, other regions (several letters imply ranges that include multiple areas).

accumulated a marginal posterior distribution clearly before and after 2.8 Ma. The highest uncertainty was recorded in the crown node of *D. canariensis*, in which only 60 % of the trees fell within the last 2.8-Ma time period (Supplementary Data Table [S4\)](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data). Previously published studies also revealed ten undetermined lineages. In total, the following 18 lineages were classifed as undetermined ([Figs 7](#page-13-0) and [8\)](#page-14-0): *Gonospermum* lineage (mean stem 3.10 Ma; mean crown unknown), *Gymnosporia* lineage (mean stem 3.78 Ma; mean crown 1.27 Ma; [Fig. 6E\)](#page-11-0), *Artemisia* lineage (mean stem 3.84; mean crown unknown), *Rhamnus crenulata* (mean stem 3.88; mean crown 1.71; [Fig.](#page-11-0) [6B\)](#page-11-0), *Pistacia lentistus* lineage I (mean stem 3.96; mean crown 1.15; [Fig. 4D](#page-9-0)), *Heberdenia excelsa* (mean stem 3.98; mean crown 1.07; [Fig. 6G\)](#page-11-0), *Juniperus turbinata* subsp. *canariensis* (mean stem 4.91, mean crown unknown; [Fig. 6D](#page-11-0)), *Bryonia verrucosa* (mean stem 5.19; mean crown 1.74; [Fig. 6C\)](#page-11-0), *Bosea*

yervamora (mean stem 5.69; mean crown 1.64; [Fig. 6A](#page-11-0)), *Rubia fruticosa* (mean stem 6.69; mean crown 2.10), *Navaea phoenicea* (mean stem 6.77; mean crown unknown), *Anagyris latifolia* (mean stem 8.20; mean crown 1.90), *Cheirolophus* lineage (mean stem 8.50; mean crown 1.70), *Hypericum canariense* (mean stem 10.80; mean crown 1.90), *Dracaena* lineage (mean stem 11.80; mean crown 2.30), *Dracunculus canariensis* (mean stem 12.10; mean crown 2.76), *Dioscorea edulis* (mean stem 13.48; mean crown unknown), and *Visnea mocanera* (mean stem 27.00; mean crown 2.50).

Ancestral area reconstructions

Biogeographic analyses supported nine lineages with stem node ranges including the Mediterranean Basin (i.e. *Asparagus* lineage II, *Bosea yervamora*, *Bryonia verrucosa*, *Dracunculus*

Fig. 6. The seven undetermined lineages (stem ages predating and crown ages postdating 2.8 Ma) and related Canarian and mainland species for the 13 timecalibrated phylogenies inferred in this study using BEAST (with the exception of *Pistacia lentistus* lineage I, which for simplifcation is included in Fig. 4D). Mean stem and crown ages and 95 % posterior credibility intervals (blue bars and values in brackets) are indicated next to the corresponding nodes. Divergence times of the most recent common ancestor (marked as TMRCA) are indicated for those groups in which stem and crown nodes showed low phylogenetic support [PP < 0.90, bootstrap (BS) support value <70]. The circles at the nodes represent phylogenetic relationships with high posterior Bayesian probability (PP) and/or BS support values (see Statistical support values legend). Colour of plant names indicates vegetation type. Asterisks represent new samples included in the present study. The letters in the stem node or TMRCA of the Canarian lineages represent the ancestral ranges inferred for that node by the ancestral area reconstruction analysis and correspond to the following geographic areas: A, Mediterranean Basin; B, Macaronesia; C, other regions (several letters imply ranges that include multiple areas).

canariensis, *Ephedra fragilis*, *Juniperus turbinata*, *Pistacia lentiscus*, *Rhamnus crenulata* and *Thesium* lineage) and six lineages with stem node ranges not including the Mediterranean Basin (i.e. *Asparagus* lineage I, *Chrysojasminum odoratissimum*, *Gymnosporia* lineage, *Heberdenia excelsa*, *Pistacia atlantica* and *Sideroxylon canariense*) ([Figs 4–6](#page-9-0), [Supplementary Data](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data) [Figs S27–S39, Supplementary Data Table S5\)](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data). No correspondence between the temporal origin of the lineages (mediterranean versus pre-mediterranean) and the ancestral ranges (including versus excluding the Mediterranean Basin) was detected in three plant lineages (i.e. *Asparagus* lineage I, *Pistacia atlantica*, *Thesium* lineage).

DISCUSSION

The thermophilous woodland is considered a relatively recent ecosystem, originated after the establishment of the Mediterranean climate in the mediterranean Basin (2.8 Ma; [Fernández-Palacios](#page-16-9) *et al.*, 2008; [Rivas-Martínez, 2009;](#page-17-1) [del](#page-16-0) [Arco and Rodríguez-Delgado, 2018](#page-16-0)). In this study, we provide new divergence time estimates (i.e. stem and crown ages) based on time-calibrated phylogenies for 16 species representative of the thermophilous Canarian vegetation, which we analysed together with previously published results from an additional 27 thermophilous plant lineages [\(Figs 7](#page-13-0) and [8](#page-14-0)).

Table 2. *List of mediterranean, pre-mediterranean and undetermined lineages (i.e. colonization events) based on the position of stem and crown ages with respect to the 2.8-million-year threshold (i.e. establishment of the mediterranean climate) of the complete list of 43 lineages*

Mediterranean	Pre-mediterranean	Undetermined
Argyranthemum lineage	Chrysojasminum odoratissimum	Anagyris latifolia
Asparagus lineage I	Crambe lineage	Artemisia lineage
Asparagus lineage II	Echium lineage	Bosea yervamora
Brachypodium arbuscula	Euphorbia sect. Aphyllis	Bryonia verrucosa
Cistus monspeliensis	<i>Ruta</i> lineage	Cheirolophus lineage
Convolvulus lineage II	Sideritis lineage	Dioscorea edulis
Ephedra fragilis	Sideroxylon canariense	<i>Dracaena</i> lineage
Erysimum lineage	Sonchus lineage	Dracunculus canariensis
Globularia lineage	<i>Thesium</i> lineage	Gonospermum lineage
Helianthemum lineage		Gymnosporia lineage
Malva canariensis		Hypericum canariense
Olea europaea subsp. guanchica		Juniperus turbinata subsp. canariensis
Pistacia atlantica		Heberdenia excelsa
Pistacia lentiscus lineage II		Navaea phoenicea
Smilax aspera		Pistacia lentiscus lineage I
Solanum lineage		Rhamnus crenulata
		Rubia fruticosa
		Visnea mocanera

In island biogeography, colonization times are more precisely considered to have taken place some time between the stem and crown ages of the island lineage ([Swenson](#page-17-33) *et al.*, 2014; [García-Verdugo](#page-16-34) *et al.*, 2019a). Based on this phylogenetic principle, our study suggests that the Canarian thermophilous plant community is composed of lineages with a temporal origin both predating (pre-mediterranean) and postdating (mediterranean) the 2.8-Ma threshold considered for the establishment of the mediterranean climate ([Figs 7](#page-13-0) and [8](#page-14-0); [Table 2](#page-12-0)). In addition, biogeographic reconstruction analyses showed that 6 of the 16 colonization events here inferred may have occurred by continental ancestors not distributed in the Mediterranean Basin [\(Figs 4–6](#page-9-0)). Taking all these results together, the thermophilous vegetation appears to be a complex assemblage of species with a heterogeneous origin in terms of colonization times and geographic origins.

Pre-mediterranean and mediterranean elements in the thermophilous plant community

As predicted by the hypothesis of a mediterranean temporal origin for the Canarian thermophilous species, a

considerable number of lineages (16) are estimated to have colonized the archipelago after the establishment of the mediterranean climate (2.8 Ma). Data from meteorological stations (<https://www.acanmet.org/>) between 200 and 600 m.a.s.l. and climatic variables used for species distribution modelling of thermophilous plants ([Coello](#page-16-39) *et al.*, [2021](#page-16-39)) indicate that current conditions in the Mediterranean Basin are similar to those of the thermophilous vegetation belt in the Canaries ([Rivas-Martínez, 2009](#page-17-1)). Since the late Pliocene (2.8 Ma), a progressive summer aridification of southern Europe and northern Africa may have produced wider distribution of the mediterranean climatic conditions that may have facilitated dispersal from the MFR to other areas. There is thus a higher likelihood of dispersal and colonization to neighbouring territories such as the Canarian archipelago since then [\(Meusel, 1965](#page-17-4); [Sunding,](#page-17-3) [1979](#page-17-3)). That is why trees with one of the most characteristic Mediterranean-type syndromes (sclerophylly, a trait displayed in leaves) may have found ideal conditions in the Canaries in the last 2.8 million years [\(Axelrod, 1975](#page-15-4); [Verdú](#page-18-1) *et al.*[, 2003;](#page-18-1) [Rundel](#page-17-8) *et al.*, 2016; [Vargas](#page-18-3) *et al.*, 2018). Our results partly support this prediction for the sclerophyllous *Olea europaea*, *Pistacia atlantica* and *Pistacia lentiscus* lineage II, but provide undetermined results for the sclerophyllous *Rhamnus crenulata* and *Pistacia lentiscus* lineage I. Alternatively, some other tree species (e.g. *Gymnosporia* spp., *Heberdenia excelsa*, *Sideroxylon canariense*, *Visnea mocanera*) with leathery leaves and thick cuticles (typically observed in sclerophyllous species) did not display evidence for an origin postdating 2.8 Ma, which did not help support a mediterranean temporal origin for all the trees characterizing the thermophilous vegetation belt.

The relatively old stem and crown ages inferred for some plant lineages clearly indicate a pre-mediterranean origin for a considerable number of the thermophilous species (9 of 43 lineages). Indeed, the following plants appear to have already been present in the Canary Islands before the establishment of the mediterranean climate: *Sideritis* lineage*, Echium* lineage, *Thesium* lineage, *Chrysojasminum odoratissimum*, *Euphorbia* sect. *Aphyllis* subsect. *Macaronesicae*, *Sideroxylon canariense, Ruta* lineage, *Crambe* lineage and *Sonchus* lineage [\(Fig. 7](#page-13-0), [Table 2\)](#page-12-0). Three non-mutually exclusive hypotheses can be put forward to explain the presence of pre-mediterranean lineages in the current Canarian thermophilous plant community: (1) a direct colonization from the mainland to a pre-existent thermophilous vegetation in pre-mediterranean times; (2) an indirect colonization from other Canarian vegetation types followed by a more recent speciation in the thermophilous vegetation; and (3) a direct colonization into non-thermophilous Canarian vegetation and *in situ* adaptation to more recently established thermophilous conditions. The frst hypothesis is supported by the fossil record. In particular, fossils of sclerophyllous leaves related to Miocene relicts have been found on the island of Gran Canaria [\(Anderson](#page-15-5) *et al.*, 2009). These macrofossils, moreover, share characteristics with certain representative species of the present-day thermophilous scrub vegetation (e.g. *Cistus*, *Gymnosporia*, *Euphorbia*). However, detailed anatomical investigation of fossil material is required for correct phylogenetic placement [\(Anderson](#page-15-5) *et al.*,

Fig. 7. Stem ages of 43 Canarian lineages including thermophilous plant species. Results from the new time-calibrated phylogenies obtained in this study are indicated with plant names in bold (references in [Supplementary Data Table S1\)](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data). Blue bars show the 95 % posterior credibility intervals and mean stem ages are marked by a black line.

[2009\)](#page-15-5). Molecular phylogenetic reconstructions and the fossil record are congruent with a Canarian palaeo-fora adapted to semi-arid conditions, scattered over dry slopes and canyons (*barrancos*) in the Canary Islands during pre-mediterranean times. This would be followed by geographic expansion of the species when the climate became more favourable. Indeed, an evolutionary process in which lineages adapted to pre-mediterranean conditions in relatively small, xeric pockets became dominant when mediterranean-like conditions were expanded has already been proposed for plants of the Mediterranean Basin ([Barrón](#page-15-6) *et al.*, 2010; [Vargas](#page-18-3) *et al.*, [2018\)](#page-18-3). The second and third hypotheses are congruent with a pattern of high differentiation into species in different vegetation belts and ecological shifts into thermophilous conditions. This includes some speciation events associated with colonization of the thermophilous woodland, as documented in most of the evolutionary radiations of Canarian plants (e.g. *Sideritis* lineage, *Echium* lineage, *Euphorbia* sect. *Aphyllis* subsect. *Macaronesicae*, *Crambe* lineage, *Sonchus* lineage; see [Supplementary Data Table S1](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data)). In any case, these three evolutionary processes could have been operating to ultimately merge into this particularly rich fora.

Impact of extinction on the inferred temporal origin of the thermophilous lineages

The time of origin (mediterranean versus pre-mediterranean) of 25 out of 43 thermophilous lineages was successfully assigned using the approach proposed in this study, whereas 18 of them remained undetermined due to long temporal gaps between stem and crown ages spanning the 2.8-Ma threshold. These gaps entail a high uncertainty for the inference of colonization times (Cano *et al.*[, 2018](#page-16-40); [García-Verdugo](#page-16-34) *et al.*, 2019a). The most striking case among those analysed herein is *Dracunculus canariensis*, for which the difference between stem and crown ages was around 10 million years. An extreme case obtained from the literature is *Visnea mocanera*, which shows a difference between stem and crown ages of 25 million years. Long stem-to-crown intervals have been previously found for other Macaronesian groups (e.g. *Cicer*, *Campylanthus*), an observation related to high extinction rates according to recent studies ([Antonelli and Sanmartín, 2011;](#page-15-7) [Nagalingum](#page-17-40) *et al.*, 2011; [Pokorny](#page-17-18) *et al.*, 2015).

High extinction rates in mainland ancestral lineages as a result of abrupt climatic and geological changes (e.g. formation

Fig. 8. Twenty-eight crown ages of Canarian thermophilous plant lineages (i.e. including more than one sample from the Canaries) of the 43 shown in [Fig. 7](#page-13-0). Results from the new time-calibrated phylogenies obtained in this study are indicated with plant names in bold, while results from previously published time-calibrated phylogenies have non-bold plant names (references in [Supplementary Data Table S1](http://academic.oup.com/aob/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/aob/mcac160#supplementary-data)). Blue bars show the 95% posterior credibility intervals, and mean crown ages are marked by a black line.

of the Sahara desert, Pleistocene climatic oscillations) has been the most commonly accepted explanation for the temporal gaps between stem and crown ages of Macaronesian lineages ([Thiv](#page-17-41) *et al.*[, 2010;](#page-17-41) [Kondraskov](#page-16-3) *et al.*, 2015). Indeed, the Rand fora (i.e. lineages that exhibit a Canarian–eastern African disjunction) is primarily explained by widespread extinction of central–western Africa lineages rather than long-distance dispersal [\(Mairal](#page-16-37) *et al.*, 2015; [Pokorny](#page-17-18) *et al.*, 2015). The extinction of lineages across the mainland may have been more pronounced in Canarian lineages of older temporal origin (i.e. premediterranean and undetermined). Potential extinction coupled with the spatial uncertainty of the geographic boundaries of the MFR in the past [\(Suc, 1984](#page-17-10); Suc *et al.*[, 2018\)](#page-17-20) makes the reconstruction of ancestral areas a suboptimal approach to evaluating the mediterranean origin of the Canarian thermophilous species, and their results thus should be taken with caution.

[García-Verdugo](#page-16-34) *et al.* (2019a) proposed that crown ages may be a more suitable measurement for the time of island colonization than stem ages based on the idea that stem ages are subject to higher temporal and spatial uncertainty as a result of mainland extinction. However, the analysis of crown ages suffers from the same problem of extinction and under-sampling, thus biasing the results to more recent times. The effect of island extinction in crown age estimates may be particularly pronounced in the thermophilous woodland because of multiple causes: (1) erosion and subsidence of fat, oldest islands (Fuerteventura, Lanzarote), which may previously have harboured large areas with this vegetation type ([Fernández-Palacios](#page-16-9) *et al.*, 2008; [Martín Osorio](#page-17-42) *et al.*, 2011); (2) geological dynamics (eruptions, earthquakes, mega-landslides) ([Carracedo](#page-16-41) *et al.*, 2001; [García-](#page-16-42)[Olivares](#page-16-42) *et al.*, 2017); and most importantly (3) human land

use and destruction of original vegetation (only 11 % currently preserved) between 200 and 600 m.a.s.l. ([Fernández-Palacios](#page-16-9) *et al.*[, 2008;](#page-16-9) [Castilla-Beltrán](#page-16-24) *et al.*, 2021). This extreme reduction of populations, continuing even in our lifetimes, makes thermophilous vegetation the most threatened ecosystem in the Canary Islands [\(Castilla-Beltrán](#page-16-24) *et al.*, 2021). This is illustrated by the few remaining individuals of non-endemic species in the thermophilous vegetation belt (*Pistacia lentiscus*, *Ephedra fragilis*), many critically endangered species (e.g. *Anagyris latifolia*, *Crambe scoparia*, *Cheirolophus duranii*, *Dracaena tamaranae*, *Echium handiense*, *Gymnosporia cryptopetala*, *Helianthemum gonzalezferreri*, *Helianthemum bramwelliorum*, *Solanum lidii*, *Solanum vespertilio* subsp. *vespertilio*, *Thesium retamoides*, *Thesium canariense*) and even several species considered already extinct (e.g. *Helianthemum aguloi*, *Thesium psilotocladum*) [\(Moreno, 2010\)](#page-17-43).

Conclusions

The approach proposed here, in which stem and crown ages are evaluated together with respect to a clear-cut threshold (2.8 Ma for the establishment of the mediterranean climate), helps test the hypotheses of temporal origins of evolutionary events even in scenarios with dramatic lineage extinction. In particular, our results provide strong evidence for a heterogeneous temporal origin of the thermophilous woodland in the Canary Islands, which harbours elements of both recent (mediterranean) and ancient Tethyan–Tertiary (pre-mediterranean) origins ([Table 2](#page-12-0)). In addition, several of these colonization events do not show ancestral areas in the Mediterranean Basin, even in some lineages postdating the establishment of the mediterranean

climate (e.g. *Asparagus* lineage I) ([Figs 4–6\)](#page-9-0). This suggests a sequential history of species colonization and assemblage in the current thermophilous plant community of the Canaries, including a previously underestimated pre-mediterranean origin. A similar pattern has been identifed for the laurel forest and xerophytic shrubland ([Kondraskov](#page-16-3) *et al.*, 2015; Sun *[et al.](#page-17-44)*, [2016;](#page-17-44) Salvo *et al.*[, 2010\)](#page-17-16). Given that the thermophilous vegetation contains the highest number of lineages previously con-sidered of Mediterranean origin ([Rivas-Martínez, 2009](#page-17-1); [del](#page-16-0) [Arco and Rodríguez-Delgado, 2018](#page-16-0); but see [Bolòs, 1996\)](#page-16-6), we hypothesize that the other fve main vegetation belts contain an even lower number of Mediterranean-like lineages [\(Vargas,](#page-17-9) [2020\)](#page-17-9). If this hypothesis was confrmed, the long-lasting view of Macaronesia as a subregion within the MFR would be seriously challenged. Different temporal and geographic origins resulted in a great deal of diversity of the Canarian fora in general, and the thermophilous plant community in particular. Interestingly, this is the most threatened Canarian vegetation belt [\(Fernández-](#page-16-9)[Palacios](#page-16-9) *et al.*, 2008; [del Arco and Rodríguez-Delgado, 2018\)](#page-16-0). The endangered status of a few relictual patches requires urgent prioritization for conservation and restoration at the regional, national and international levels.

SUPPLEMENTARY DATA

Supplementary data are available online at [https://academic.oup.](https://academic.oup.com/aob) [com/aob](https://academic.oup.com/aob) and consist of the following. Figures S1–S13: majority rule consensus trees of the 13 plant groups analysed in this study resulting from applying Bayesian inference in MrBayes and using previously published phylogenetic datasets in combination with newly generated sequences. Figures S14–S26: time-calibrated phylogenies of the 13 plant groups analysed in this study obtained in BEAST using previously published phylogenetic datasets in combination with newly generated sequences. Figures S27–S39: biogeographic reconstructions of ancestral ranges of the 13 plant groups analysed in this study resulting from applying dispersal– extinction–cladogenesis analyses using the BioGeoBEARS R package. Table S1: information extracted from the literature and obtained in this study for the 43 plant lineages, including thermophilous species from the Canary Islands (Macaronesia), for hypothesis testing. Table S2: studied taxa and their corresponding collection code, voucher information, island, locality, collection date, collector's name, DNA-sequenced regions and GenBank accession numbers. Table S3: primers and PCR cycles used for sequencing DNA regions of the 13 plant groups analysed in this study. Table S4: detailed information on the 16 lineages with thermophilous species recovered by BEAST analyses of the 13 plant groups of this study. Table S5: results of the ancestral area reconstruction under the dispersal–extinction–cladogenesis analyses performed on the 13 newly generated time-calibrated phylogenies including thermophilous species in the Canary Islands analysed in this study. Methods S1: details of the maximum likelihood phylogenetic analyses performed in this study.

FUNDING

This work was supported by the Spanish Ministerio de Economía y Competitividad (MINECO) (grant no. PGC2018-101650-B-I00).

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We thank Maria Olangua, Stephan Scholz, Luis Delgado, José García Casanova, Sara Mendes, Javier Romero, Javier Diéguez and Daniel Pareja for their help with feld sampling. Our sincere thanks to the herbaria from Real Jardín Botánico de Madrid (MA), Jardín de Aclimatación de La Orotava (ORT), University of Seville (SEV) and Institut Botànic de Barcelona (IBB) and their curators (Leopoldo Medina, Alfredo Reyes, Francisco Javier Salgueiro and Neus Nualart) for permission to study herbarium specimens. We also thank the Regional Government of the Canary Islands and the following institutions for granting permits to collect plants: Cabildo Insular de La Palma, Cabildo de El Hierro, Cabildo de Tenerife and Teide National Park. We would like to thank the following authors for sharing their DNA sequence matrices, chronograms or other information on phylogenetic data of groups with Canarian species: Carlos García-Verdugo, Daniel Andrawus Zhigila, Daniel L. Nickrent, Felix Forest, Friedrich Ehrendorfer, Gerald M. Schneeweiss, Guilhem Mansion, Guillaume Besnard, Hanno Schaefer, Isabel Sanmartín, Javier Francisco-Ortega, Jens G. Rohwer, Juan Viruel, Manuel Acosta, Lars Nauheimer Li Lang, Lisa Pokorny, Marc Appelhans, Mario Mairal, Mario Rincón, Mark W. Chase, Muthama Muasya, Rocío Deanna, Susanne Renner, Sven Buerki, Ulf Swenson, Vanessa Di Vincenzo, and some other botanists who helped with advice and information. Manuscript writing was revised by Guido Jones, funded by Cabildo de Tenerife under the TFinnova Programme, supported by MEDI and FDCAN.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST

The authors declare no confict of interest.

LITERATURE CITED

- **Albaladejo RG**, **Martín-Hernanz S**, **Reyes-Betancort JA**, **Santos-Guerra A**, **Olangua-Corral M**, **Aparicio A. 2021**. Reconstruction of the spatio-temporal and ecological patterns of dispersal and diversifcation of *Helianthemum* sect. *Helianthemum* (Cistaceae) in the Canary Islands using genotyping by sequencing data. *Annals of Botany* **127**: 597–611.
- **Anderson CL**, **Channing A**, **Zamuner AB. 2009**. Life, death and fossilization on Gran Canaria – implications for Macaronesian biogeography and molecular dating. *Journal of Biogeography* **36**: 2189–2201. doi:[10.1111/j.1365-2699.2009.02222.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2699.2009.02222.x).
- **Antonelli A**, **Sanmartín I. 2011**. Mass extinction, gradual cooling, or rapid radiation? Reconstructing the spatiotemporal evolution of the ancient angiosperm genus *Hedyosmum* (Chloranthaceae) using empirical and simulated approaches. *Systematic Biology* **60**: 596–615. doi[:10.1093/sysbio/syr062.](https://doi.org/10.1093/sysbio/syr062)
- **Appelhans MS**, **Paetzold C**, **Wood KR**, **Wagner WL. 2020**. RADseq resolves the phylogeny of Hawaiian *Myrsine* (Primulaceae) and provides evidence for hybridization. *Journal of Systematics and Evolution* **58**: 823–840. doi:[10.1111/jse.12668](https://doi.org/10.1111/jse.12668).
- **Axelrod DI. 1975**. Evolution and biogeography of the Madrean-Tethyan sclerophyll vegetation. *Annals of the Missouri Botanical Garden* **62**: 280– 334. doi:[10.2307/2395199](https://doi.org/10.2307/2395199).
- **Barrón E**, **Rivas-Carballo R**, **Postigo-Mijarra JM**, *et al*. **2010**. The Cenozoic vegetation of the Iberian Peninsula: a synthesis. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology* **162**: 382–402. doi:[10.1016/j.revpalbo.2009.11.007](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.revpalbo.2009.11.007).
- **Bocquet G**, **Widler B**, **Kiefer H. 1978**. The Messinian Model—A new outlook for the foristics and systematics of the Mediterranean area. *Candollea* **33**: 269–287.
- **Bolmgren K**, **Oxelman B. 2004**. Generic limits in *Rhamnus* L. s.l. (Rhamnaceae) inferred from nuclear and chloroplast DNA sequence phylogenies. *Taxon* **53**: 383–390. doi[:10.2307/4135616](https://doi.org/10.2307/4135616).
- **Bolòs O. 1996**. Acerca de la fora macaronésica. *Anales del Jardín Botánico de Madrid* **54**: 457–461.
- **Bramwell D. 1976**. The endemic fora of the Canary Islands: distribution, relationships and phytogeography. In: **Kunkel G**, ed. *Biogeography and ecology in the Canary Islands*. The Hague: Dr W. Junk, 207–240.
- **Cano A**, **Bacon CD**, **Stauffer FW**, **Antonelli A**, **Serrano-Serrano ML**, **Perret M. 2018**. The roles of dispersal and mass extinction in shaping palm diversity across the Caribbean. *Journal of Biogeography* **45**: 1432–1443.
- **Carine MA**, **Russell SJ**, **Santos-Guerra A**, **Francisco-Ortega J. 2004**. Relationships of the Macaronesian and Mediterranean floras: molecular evidence for multiple colonizations into Macaronesia and backcolonization of the continent in *Convolvulus* (Convolvulaceae). *American Journal of Botany* **91**: 1070–1085.
- **Carracedo JC**, **Rodríguez Badiola E**, **Guillou H**, **De La Nuez J**, **Pérez Torrado FJ. 2001**. Geology and volcanology of La Palma and El Hierro, Western Canaries. *Estudios Geológicos* **57**: 175–273.
- **Castilla-Beltrán A**, **de Nascimento L**, **Fernández-Palacios JM**, *et al*. **2021**. Anthropogenic transitions from forested to human-dominated landscapes in southern Macaronesia. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the USA* **118**: e2022215118.
- **Caujapé-Castells J**, **García-Verdugo C**, **Marrero-Rodríguez A**, **Fernández-Palacios JM**, **Crawford DJ**, **Mort ME. 2017**. Island ontogenies, syngameons, and the origins and evolution of genetic diversity in the Canarian endemic fora. *Perspectives in Plant Ecology, Evolution and Systematics* **27**: 9–22. doi[:10.1016/j.ppees.2017.03.003.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ppees.2017.03.003)
- **Chen S**, **Kim DK**, **Mark WMW**, **Kim JH. 2013**. Networks in a large-scale phylogenetic analysis: reconstructing evolutionary history of Asparagales (Lilianae) based on four plastid genes. *PLoS One* **8**: e59472.
- **Coello AJ**, **Fernández-Mazuecos M**, **García-Verdugo C**, **Vargas P. 2021**. Phylogeographic sampling guided by species distribution modeling reveals the Quaternary history of the Mediterranean-Canarian *Cistus monspeliensis* (Cistaceae). *Journal of Systematics and Evolution* **59**: 262–277.
- **Davis CC**, **Webb CO**, **Wurdack KJ**, **Jaramillo CA**, **Donoghue MJ. 2005**. Explosive radiation of Malpighiales supports a mid-Cretaceous origin of modern tropical rain forests. *American Naturalist* **165**: E36–E65. doi[:10.1086/428296.](https://doi.org/10.1086/428296)
- **del Arco Aguilar MJ**, **Rodríguez-Delgado O. 2018**. In: **Werger MJA**, ed. *Vegetation of the Canary Islands*. Cham: Springer, pp. 83–319.
- **del Arco Aguilar MJ**, **Pérez-de-Paz PL**, **Acebes JR**, *et al*. **2006**. Bioclimatology and climatophilous vegetation of Tenerife (Canary Islands). *Annales Botanici Fennici* **43**: 167–192.
- **Di Vincenzo V**, **Gruenstaeudl M**, **Nauheimer L**, *et al*. **2017**. Evolutionary diversifcation of the African achyranthoid clade (Amaranthaceae) in the context of sterile fower evolution and epizoochory. *Annals of Botany* **122**: 69–85.
- **Drummond AJ**, **Rambaut A. 2007**. BEAST: Bayesian evolutionary analysis by sampling trees. *BMC Evolutionary Biology* **7**: 214. doi[:10.1186/1471-2148-7-214.](https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2148-7-214)
- **Drummond AJ**, **Ho SYW**, **Phillips MJ**, **Rambaut A. 2006**. Relaxed phylogenetics and dating with confdence. *PLoS Biology* **4**: e88. doi[:10.1371/journal.pbio.0040088.](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pbio.0040088)
- **Edgar RC. 2004**. MUSCLE: multiple sequence alignment with high accuracy and high throughput. *Nucleic Acids Research* **32**: 1792–1797. doi[:10.1093/](https://doi.org/10.1093/nar/gkh340) [nar/gkh340](https://doi.org/10.1093/nar/gkh340).
- **Engler A. 1879**. *Versuch einer Entwicklungsgeschichte der Pfanzenwelt, insbesondere der Florengebiete seit der Tertiärperiode. I. Die extratropischen Gebiete der nördlichen Hemisphäre*. Leipzig: Wilhelm Engelmann.
- **Escudero M**, **Balao F**, **Martín-Bravo S**, **Valente L**, **Valcárcel V. 2018**. Is the diversifcation of Mediterranean Basin plant lineages coupled to karyotypic changes? *Plant Biology* **20**: 166–175.
- **Fernández-Palacios JM**, **Otto R**, **Delgado JD**, *et al*. **2008**. *Los bosques termóflos de Canarias. Proyecto LIFE04/NAT/ES/000064*. Cabildo Insular de Tenerife. Santa Cruz de Tenerife.
- **Fiz-Palacios O**, **Valcárcel V. 2013**. From Messinian crisis to Mediterranean climate: a temporal gap of diversifcation recovered from multiple plant phylogenies. *Perspectives in Plant Ecology, Evolution and Systematics* **15**: 130–137. doi[:10.1016/j.ppees.2013.02.002](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ppees.2013.02.002).
- **Forest F. 2009**. Calibrating the tree of life: fossils, molecules and evolutionary timescales. *Annals of Botany* **104**: 789–794. doi[:10.1093/aob/mcp192.](https://doi.org/10.1093/aob/mcp192)
- **Francisco-Ortega J**, **Fuertes-Aguilar J**, **Kim SC**, **Santos- Guerra A**, **Crawford DJ**, **Jansen RK. 2002**. Phylogeny of the Macaronesian

endemic *Crambe* section *Dendrocrambe* (Brassicaceae) based on internal transcribed spacer sequences of nuclear ribosomal DNA. *American Journal of Botany* **88**: 161–169.

- **García-Olivares V**, **López H**, **Patiño J**, *et al*. **2017**. Evidence for megalandslides as drivers of island colonization. *Journal of Biogeography* **44**: 1053–1064.
- **García-Verdugo C**, **Caujapé-Castells J**, **Sanmartín I. 2019***a*. Colonization time on island settings: lessons from the Hawaiian and Canary Island foras. *Botanical Journal of the Linnean Society* **191**: 155–163. doi:[10.1093/](https://doi.org/10.1093/botlinnean/boz044) [botlinnean/boz044](https://doi.org/10.1093/botlinnean/boz044).
- **García-Verdugo C**, **Caujapé-Castells J**, **Illera JC**, *et al*. **2019***b*. Pleistocene extinctions as drivers of biogeographical patterns on the easternmost Canary Islands. *Journal of Biogeography* **46**: 845–859.
- **Gernhard T. 2008**. The conditioned reconstructed process. *Journal of Theoretical Biology* **253**: 769–778.
- **Grant K**, **Amarathunga U**, **Amies J**, *et al*. **2022**. Abrupt change in North African hydroclimate and landscape evolution 3.2 million years ago. *Communications Earth & Environment* **3**: 11.
- **Grehan JR. 2016**. Biogeographic relationships between Macaronesia and the Americas. *Australian Systematic Botany* **29**: 447–472. doi:[10.1071/](https://doi.org/10.1071/sb16051) [sb16051.](https://doi.org/10.1071/sb16051)
- **Grover CE**, **Arick MA 2nd**, **Conover JL**, *et al*. **2017**. Comparative genomics of an unusual biogeographic disjunction in the cotton tribe (Gossypieae) yields insights into genome downsizing. *Genome Biology and Evolution* **9**: 3328–3344. doi[:10.1093/gbe/evx248.](https://doi.org/10.1093/gbe/evx248)
- **Hernández-Molina FJ**, **Stow DA**, **Alvarez-Zarikian CA**, *et al*. **2014**. Onset of Mediterranean outfow into the North Atlantic. *Science* **344**: 1244–1250.
- **Herrera CM. 1992**. Historical effects and sorting processes as explanations for contemporary ecological patterns: character syndromes in Mediterranean woody plants. *American Naturalist* **140**: 421–446. doi[:10.1086/285420](https://doi.org/10.1086/285420).
- **Hipsley CA**, **Müller J. 2014**. Beyond fossil calibrations: realities of molecular clock practices in evolutionary biology. *Frontiers in Genetics* **5**: 1–11.
- **Ho SYW**, **Phillips MJ. 2009**. Accounting for calibration uncertainty in phylogenetic estimation of evolutionary divergence times. *Systematic Biology* **58**: 367–380. doi[:10.1093/sysbio/syp035](https://doi.org/10.1093/sysbio/syp035).
- **Ickert-Bond SM**, **Rydin C**, **Renner SS. 2009**. A fossil-calibrated relaxed clock for *Ephedra* indicates an Oligocene age for the divergence of Asian and New World clades and Miocene dispersal into South America. *Journal of Systematics and Evolution* **47**: 444–456. doi:[10.1111/j.1759-6831.2009.00053.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1759-6831.2009.00053.x).
- **Jeyarani JN**, **Yohannan R**, **Vijayavalli D**, **Dwivedi MD**, **Pandey AK. 2018**. Phylogenetic analysis and evolution of morphological characters in the genus *Jasminum* L. (Oleaceae) in India. *Journal of Genetics* **97**: 1225– 1239. doi:[10.1007/s12041-018-1019-4](https://doi.org/10.1007/s12041-018-1019-4).
- **Jiménez-Moreno G**, **Fauquette S**, **Suc JP. 2010**. Miocene to Pliocene vegetation reconstruction and climate estimates in the Iberian Peninsula from pollen data. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology* **162**: 403410–403415. doi:[10.1016/j.revpalbo.2009.08.001](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.revpalbo.2009.08.001).
- **Keeley SC**, **Funk VA. 2011**. Origin and evolution of Hawaiian endemics: new patterns revealed by molecular phylogenetic studies. In: **Bramwell D**, **Caujapé-Castells J**, eds. *The biology of island foras*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 57–88.
- **Kondraskov P**, **Schütz N**, **Schüßler C**, *et al*. **2015**. Biogeography of Mediterranean hotspot biodiversity: re-evaluating the 'Tertiary relict' hypothesis of Macaronesian laurel forests. *PLoS One* **10**: e0132091. doi:[10.1371/journal.pone.0132091](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0132091).
- **Lamm KS**, **Redelings BD. 2009**. Reconstructing ancestral ranges in historical biogeography: properties and prospects. *Journal of Systematics and Evolution* **47**: 369–382. doi[:10.1111/j.1759-6831.2009.00042.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1759-6831.2009.00042.x).
- **Lobin W. 1982**. *Untersuchung über Flora, Vegetation und biogeographische Beziehungen der Kapverdischen Inseln*. Frankfurt: Courier Forschungsinstitut Senckenberg.
- **Mai DH. 1995**. *Tertiäre Vegetationsgeschichte Europas*. Jena: Gustav Fischer.
- **Mairal M**, **Pokorny L**, **Aldasoro JJ**, **Alarcón M**, **Sanmartín I. 2015**. Ancient vicariance and climate-driven extinction continental-wide disjunctions in Africa: the case of the Rand fora genus *Canarina* (Campanulaceae). *Molecular Ecology* **24**: 1335–1354. doi:[10.1111/mec.13114](https://doi.org/10.1111/mec.13114).
- **Mansion G**, **Rosenbaum G**, **Schoenenberger N**, **Bacchetta G**, **Rosselló JA**, **Conti E. 2008**. Phylogenetic analysis informed by geological history supports multiple, sequential invasions of the Mediterranean Basin by the angiosperm family Araceae. *Systematic Biology* **57**: 269–285. doi:[10.1080/10635150802044029](https://doi.org/10.1080/10635150802044029).
- **Mao K**, **Hao G**, **Liu J**, **Adams RP**, **Milne RI. 2010**. Diversifcation and biogeography of *Juniperus* (Cupressaceae): variable diversifcation rates and multiple intercontinental dispersals. *New Phytologist* **188**: 254–272. doi[:10.1111/j.1469-8137.2010.03351.x.](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8137.2010.03351.x)
- **Martín Osorio VE**, **Wildpret W**, **De la Torre W**, **Scholz S. 2011**. Relict ecosystems of thermophilous and laurel forest as biodiversity hotspots in Fuerteventura, Canary Islands. *Plant Biosystems* **145**: 180–185.
- **Matzke NJ. 2013**. Probabilistic historical biogeography: new models for founder-event speciation, imperfect detection, and fossils allow improved accuracy and model-testing. *Frontiers of Biogeography* **4**: 242–247.
- **Meusel H. 1965**. Die Reliktvegetation der Kanarischen Inseln in ihren Beziehungen zur süd- undmitteleuropäischen Flora. In: **Gersch M**, ed. *Gesammelte Vorträge über moderne Probleme der Abstammunslehre*, **Vol. 1**. Jena: Friedrich-Schiller-Universität, 17–136.
- **Moreno JC**. **(coord.). 2010**. *Lista roja de la fora vascular española. Actualización con los datos de la adenda 2010 al atlas y libro rojo de la fora vascular amenazada.* Madrid: Sociedad Española de Biología de la Conservación de Plantas.
- **Moore MJ**, **Soltis PS**, **Bell CD**, **Burleigh G**, **Soltis DE. 2010**. Phylogenetic analysis of 83 plastid genes further resolves the early diversifcation of eudicots. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the USA* **107**: 4623–4628.
- **Nagalingum NS**, **Marshall CR**, **Quental TB**, **Rai HS**, **Little DP**, **Mathews S. 2011**. Recent synchronous radiation of a living fossil. *Science* **334**: 796–799. doi[:10.1126/science.1209926](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1209926).
- **Nauheimer L**, **Metzler D**, **Renner SS. 2012**. Global history of the ancient monocot family Araceae inferred with models accounting for past continental positions and previous ranges based on fossils. *New Phytologist* **195**: 938–950. doi[:10.1111/j.1469-8137.2012.04220.x.](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8137.2012.04220.x)
- **Nezadal W**, **Welss W. 2009**. Aportaciones al conocimiento del bosque termóflo en el noroeste de Tenerife (Islas Canarias). In: **Beltrán Tejera E**, **Afonso-Carrillo J**, **García Gallo A**, **Rodríguez Delgado O**, eds. *Homenaje al Profesor Dr. Wolfredo Wildpret de la Torre.* La Laguna: Instituto de Estudios Canarios, 229–244.
- **Norup MF**, **Petersen G**, **Sandie Burrows S**, *et al*. **2015**. Evolution of *Asparagus* L. (Asparagaceae): out-of-South-Africa and multiple origins of sexual dimorphism. *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution* **92**: 25–44.
- **Oberprieler CO**, **Ott T**, **Hipper A**, *et al*. **2017**. Pleistocene shaping of genetic diversity in a monsoon-affected environment: the case of *Gymnosporia* (Celastraceae) in the southern Arabian Peninsula. *Plant Systematics and Evolution* **303**: 1399–1412. doi:[10.1007/s00606-017-1464-1](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00606-017-1464-1).
- **Onstein RE**, **Carter RJ**, **Xing YW**, **Richardson JE**, **Linder HP. 2015**. Do Mediterranean-type ecosystems have a common history? Insights from the buckthorn family (Rhamnaceae). *Evolution* **69**: 756–771. doi[:10.1111/](https://doi.org/10.1111/evo.12605) [evo.12605](https://doi.org/10.1111/evo.12605).
- **Palmarev E. 1989**. Paleontological evidences of the tertiary history and the origin of the Mediterranean sclerophyll dendrofora. *Plant Systematics and Evolution* **162**: 93–107.
- **Peñuelas J**, **Lloret F**, **Montoya R. 2001**. Severe drought effects on Mediterranean woody fora in Spain. *Forest Science* **47**: 214–218.
- **Pillon Y**, **Buerki S. 2017**. How old are island endemics? *Biological Journal of the Linnean Society* **121**: 469–474. doi:[10.1093/biolinnean/blx005](https://doi.org/10.1093/biolinnean/blx005).
- **Pokorny L**, **Riina R**, **Mairal M**, *et al*. **2015**. Living on the edge: timing of Rand fora disjunctions congruent with ongoing aridifcation in Africa. *Frontiers in Genetics* **6**: 154.
- **Posada D. 2008**. jModelTest: phylogenetic model averaging. *Molecular Biology and Evolution* **25**: 1253–1256. doi:[10.1093/molbev/msn083](https://doi.org/10.1093/molbev/msn083).
- **Postigo Mijarra JM**, **Barrón E**, **Gómez Manzaneque F**, **Morla C. 2009**. Floristic changes in the Iberian Peninsula and Balearic Islands (south-west Europe) during the Cenozoic. *Journal of Biogeography* **36**: 2025–2043.
- **Quézel P. 1978**. Analysis of the fora of Mediterranean and Saharan Africa. *Annals of the Missouri Botanical Garden* **65**: 479–534. doi[:10.2307/2398860.](https://doi.org/10.2307/2398860)
- **Rambaut A**, **Drummond AJ. 2016**. *TreeStat v.1.8.4: tree statistic calculation tool*. [http://beast.community/.](http://beast.community/) (June 2022, date last accessed)
- **Rambaut A**, **Drummond AJ**, **Xie D**, **Baele G**, **Suchard MA. 2018**. Posterior summarisation in Bayesian phylogenetics using Tracer 1.7. *Systematic Biology* **67**: 901–904. doi[:10.1093/sysbio/syy032](https://doi.org/10.1093/sysbio/syy032).
- **Read J**, **Sanson GD. 2003**. Characterizing sclerophylly: the mechanical properties of a diverse range of leaf types. *New Phytologist* **160**: 81–99. doi[:10.1046/j.1469-8137.2003.00855.x.](https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1469-8137.2003.00855.x)
- **Rivas-Martínez S. 2009**. Aportaciones al conocimiento del bosque termóflo en el noroeste de Tenerife (Islas Canarias). In: **Beltrán Tejera E**,

Afonso-Carrillo J, **García Gallo A**, **Rodríguez Delgado O**, eds. *Homenaje al Profesor Dr. Wolfredo Wildpret de la Torre.* La Laguna: Instituto de Estudios Canarios, 255–296.

- **Ronquist F**, **Teslenko M**, **Van der Mark P**, *et al*. **2012**. MrBayes 3.2: effcient Bayesian phylogenetic inference and model choice across a large model space. *Systematic Biology* **61**: 539–542.
- **Rose JP**, **Kleist TJ**, **Löfstrand SD**, **Drew BT**, **Schönenberger J**, **Sytsma KJ. 2018**. Phylogeny, historical biogeography and diversifcation of angiosperm order Ericales suggest ancient Neotropical and East Asian connections. *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution* **122**: 59–79. doi:[10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ympev.2018.01.014) [ympev.2018.01.014.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ympev.2018.01.014)
- **Rundel PW**, **Arroyo MTK**, **Cowling RM**, **Keeley JE**, **Lamont BB**, **Vargas P. 2016**. Mediterranean biomes: evolution of their vegetation, foras, and climate. *Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics* **47**: 383–407.
- **Salvo G**, **Ho SYW**, **Rosenbaum G**, **Ree R**, **Conti E. 2010**. Tracing the temporal and spatial origins of island endemics in the Mediterranean region: a case study from the *Citrus* family (*Ruta* L., Rutaceae). *Systematic Biology* **59**: 705–722. doi[:10.1093/sysbio/syq046](https://doi.org/10.1093/sysbio/syq046).
- **Sanmartín I. 2014**. Biogeography. In: **Vargas P**, **Zardoya R**, eds. *The tree of life*. Sunderland: Sinauer Associates, 156–166.
- **Sanmartín I**, **van der Mark P**, **Ronquist F. 2008**. Inferring dispersal: a Bayesian approach to phylogeny-based island biogeography, with special reference to the Canary Islands. *Journal of Biogeography* **35**: 428–449. doi:[10.1111/j.1365-2699.2008.01885.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2699.2008.01885.x).
- **Schaefer H**, **Heibl C**, **Renner SS. 2009**. Gourds afoat: a dated phylogeny reveals an Asian origin of the gourd family (Cucurbitaceae) and numerous oversea dispersal events. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B Biological Sciences* **276**: 843–851.
- **Schimper AFW. 1903**. *Plant geography upon a physiological basis*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- **Schüßler C**, **Bräuchler C**, **Reyes-Betancort JA**, **Koch MA**, **Thiv M. 2019**. Island biogeography of the Macaronesian *Gesnouinia* and Mediterranean *Soleirolia* (Parietarieae, Urticaceae) with implications for the evolution of insular woodiness. *Taxon* **68**: 537–556.
- **Spalik K**, **Banasiak L**, **Feist MA**, **Downie SR. 2014**. Recurrent short-distance dispersal explains wide distributions of hydrophytic umbellifers (Apiaceae tribe Oenantheae). *Journal of Biogeography* **41**: 1559–1571.
- **Stride G**, **Nylinder S**, **Swenson U. 2014**. Revisiting the biogeography of *Sideroxylon* (Sapotaceae) and an evaluation of the taxonomic status of *Argania* and *Spiniluma*. *Australian Systematic Botany* **27**: 104–118. doi:[10.1071/sb14010](https://doi.org/10.1071/sb14010).
- **Suc JP. 1984**. Origin and evolution of the Mediterranean vegetation and climate in Europe. *Nature* **307**: 429–432. doi:[10.1038/307429a0.](https://doi.org/10.1038/307429a0)
- **Suc JP**, **Popescu M**, **Fauquette S. 2018**. Reconstruction of Mediterranean fora, vegetation and climate for the last 23 million years based on an extensive pollen dataset. *Ecologia Mediterranea* **44**: 53–85.
- **Sun Y**, **Li Y**, **Vargas-Mendoza CF**, **Wang F**, **Xing F. 2016**. Colonization and diversifcation of the *Euphorbia* species (sect. *Aphyllis* subsect. *Macaronesicae*) on the Canary Islands. *Scientifc Reports* **6**: 34454.
- **Sunding P. 1979**. Origins of the Macaronesian fora. In: **Bramwell D**, ed. *Plants and islands*. New York: Academic Press, 13–40.
- **Swenson U**, **Nylinder S**, **Munzinger J. 2014**. Sapotaceae biogeography supports New Caledonia being an old Darwinian island. *Journal of Biogeography* **41**: 797–809.
- **Takhtajan A. 1986**. *Floristic regions of the world* (translation by C. Jeffrey). Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd.
- **Thiv M**, **Thulin M**, **Hjertson M**, **Kropf M**, **Linder HP. 2010**. Evidence for a vicariant origin of Macaronesian–Eritreo/Arabian disjunctions in *Campylanthus* Roth (Plantaginaceae). *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution* **54**: 607–616. doi[:10.1016/j.ympev.2009.10.009.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ympev.2009.10.009)
- **Tzedakis PC. 2007**. Seven ambiguities in the Mediterranean palaeoenvironmental narrative. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **26**: 2042–2066. doi:[10.1016/j.quascirev.2007.03.014](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2007.03.014).
- **Valente L**, **Illera JC**, **Havenstein K**, **Pallien T**, **Etienne RS**, **Tiedemann R. 2017**. Equilibrium bird species diversity in Atlantic islands. *Current Biology* **27**: 1660–1666.e5. doi:[10.1016/j.cub.2017.04.053](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2017.04.053).
- **Vargas P. 2007**. Are Macaronesian islands refugia of relict plant lineages?: a molecular survey. In: **Weiss S, Ferrand N**, eds. *Phylogeography of southern European refugia*. Dordrecht: Springer, 297–314.
- **Vargas P. 2020**. The Mediterranean foristic region: high diversity of plants and vegetation types. In: **Goldstein MI**, **DellaSala DA**, eds. *Encyclopedia of the world's biomes*, **Vol. 3**. Amsterdam, The Netherlands. Elsevier, 602–616.
- **Vargas P**, **Valente LM**, **Blanco-Pastor JL**, *et al*. **2014**. Testing the biogeographical congruence of palaeoforas using molecular phylogenetics: snapdragons and the Madrean-Tethyan fora. *Journal of Biogeography* **41**: 932–943.
- **Vargas P**, **Fernández-Mazuecos M**, **Heleno R. 2018**. Phylogenetic evidence for a Miocene origin of Mediterranean lineages: species diversity, reproductive traits, and geographical isolation. *Plant Biology* **20**: 157–165.
- **Verdú M**, **Dávila P**, **García-Fayos P**, **Flores-Hernández N**, **Valiente-Banuet A. 2003**. 'Convergent' traits of Mediterranean woody plants belong to pre-Mediterranean lineages. *Biological Journal of the Linnean Society* **78**: $415 - 427$
- **Volz SM**, **Renner SS. 2008**. Hybridization, polyploidy, and evolutionary transitions between monoecy and dioecy in *Bryonia* (Cucurbitaceae). *American Journal of Botany* **95**: 1297–1306. doi[:10.3732/ajb.0800187.](https://doi.org/10.3732/ajb.0800187)
- **White OW**, **Reyes-Betancort J**, **Chapman MA**, **Carine MA. 2020**. Geographical isolation, habitat shifts and hybridisation in the diversifcation of the Macaronesian endemic genus *Argyranthemum* (Asteraceae). *New Phytologist* **228**: 1953–1971.
- **Xie L**, **Yang Z-Y**, **Wen J**, **Li D-Z**, **Yi T-S. 2014**. Biogeographic history of *Pistacia* (Anacardiaceae), emphasizing the evolution of the Madrean-Tethyan and the eastern Asian-Tethyan disjunctions. *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution* **77**: 136–146.
- **Yang Z**, **Rannala B. 2006**. Bayesian estimation of species divergence times under a molecular clock using multiple fossil calibrations with soft bounds. *Molecular Biology and Evolution* **23**: 212–226.
- **Zhigila DA**, **Verboom GA**, **Muasya AM. 2020**. An infrageneric classifcation of *Thesium* (Santalaceae) based on molecular phylogenetic data. *Taxon* **69**: 100–123. doi[:10.1002/tax.12202](https://doi.org/10.1002/tax.12202).